Aristotle's syllogistic from a dialogical perspective

Zoe McConaughey Lille Univ. (France), UMR STL 8163 <u>zoe.mc-conaughey@univ-lille</u>.

In line with the work of Ernst Kapp, *Greek Foundations of Traditional Logic* (1942), scholars have recently challenged the traditional view of Aristotelian logic, which separates the *Topics* and the *Analytics*, by stressing the importance of the *Analytics*' dialectical background, and therefore its links with the *Topics* (e.g. Crubellier 2011; Marion & Rückert 2016; Crubellier, et al. 2019; Kapantais & Karamanolis forthcoming). They stress in this fashion the role of dialogues in Aristotelian logic. However, since the syllogistic of the *Prior Analytics* is the part of Aristotle's logic which seems the least dialogical, a key element for defending a dialogical interpretation of Aristotle's logic as a whole consists in providing strong grounds for interpreting syllogistic in a dialogical way. Taking stock of Michel Crubellier's interpretation of the *sullogismos* as the recapitulation moment in a dialectical debate, this talk will insist (in a first part) on the role of objections (*enstaseis*) in dialectic in order to bridge the gap between the dialectical *sullogismos* of the *Topics* and the *sullogismos* of the *Prior Analytics*.

And yet, even with strong textual evidence in favor of a continuity between the *Topics* and the *Prior Analytics*, external factors weaken this interpretation: there are modern reconstructions of syllogistic in non-dialogical formal frameworks which give weight to non-dialogical interpretations of the *Prior Analytics*. In order to give the dialogical interpretation of the *Prior Analytics* a chance, I have reconstructed assertoric syllogistic in a modern, dialogical framework, namely the framework of "dialogical logic" first developed by Paul Lorenzen and Kuno Lorenz in the 1970s in Erlangen. The second part of this talk will give an overview of this reconstruction and will show the links with the dialogical interpretation based on Aristotle's texts.

Crubellier, Michel 2011. "Du sullogismos au syllogisme", *Revue Philosophique de la France et de l'Étranger*, 1, pp. 17–36.

Crubellier, Michel, Mathieu Marion, Zoé McConaughey, Shahid Rahman 2019. "Dialectic, the Dictum de Omni and Ecthesis", *History and Philosophy of Logic*, 40(3), pp. 207–233. <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/01445340.2019.1586623</u>

Kapantais, Doukas & George Karamanolis (eds) forthcoming. *Syllogistic and Dialectic*. Special volume of the journal *Philosophia* of the Academy of Athens.

Kapp, Ernst 1942. *Greek Foundations of Traditional Logic*, Columbia University Press: New York Lorenzen, Paul & Lorenz, Kuno 1978. *Dialogische Logik*, Wissenschaftlische Buchgesellschaft: Darmstadt

Marion, Mathieu & Helge Rückert 2016. "Aristotle on Universal Quantification: A Study from the Point of View of Game Semantics", *History and Philosophy of Logic*, 37(3), pp. 201–229. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01445340.2015.1089043